



## Instructions for Reviewers of Reviews

**SCIENCE'S MISSION:** *Science* seeks to publish those papers that are most influential in their fields and that will significantly advance scientific understanding. Selected papers should present novel and broadly important data, syntheses, or concepts. They should merit the recognition by the scientific community and general public provided by publication in *Science*, beyond that provided by specialty journals.

### CRITERIA FOR JUDGMENT

**Reviews**, except for those in Special Issues, are now published online (with an abstract in print), where additional length and references, and enhanced media, are possible. They should provide a balanced overview of recent work (past three years) that lead to a new, interesting synthesis of an active area of research. A review can cover some work from the authors' own laboratory. Ideally the Review should be provocative, and opinionated but rooted in a balanced survey of the literature, and include original thinking or re-analysis.

**Overall Recommendation:** On the basis of the mission statement above, recommend in your review whether the paper should be published in *Science* and provide a more detailed critique based on the following:

**Technical Merit.** The data cited or presented and arguments should justify the conclusions and inferences. The Review should correctly cite important discoveries in the field and, although it may focus primarily on work done in one laboratory or by one group of investigators, it should be set in the context of, and acknowledge, work done by others whether or not they have conflicting views.

**Comprehensibility.** General readers should be able to learn from the article what has been firmly established and what are significant unresolved questions.

**Length.** Online reviews can be up to 6000 words in length and can include up to 100 references and 4-6 display items (figures and tables). If the Review exceeds these guidelines, we would appreciate suggestions for shortening it.

If the review is meant for print publication as part of a Special Issue, they should be about 3500 words in length and contain about 40 references and at most four display items. Special Issue reviews will be indicated by a note from the editor.

**Supplementary Materials.** Supplementary Materials for Reviews includes features and data that cannot be presented as part of a usual PDF or online format and cannot be easily integrated into the main text. They must be directly related to the conclusions of the paper. Your review should include an evaluation of the Supplementary Materials.

**Security:** We ask reviewers to inform us if they have concerns that release of this paper may pose a danger to public health, safety, or security. Such concerns will be brought to the attention of the Editor-in-Chief for further evaluation.

**Conflict of Interest:** If you cannot judge this paper impartially, please notify us immediately. If you have any financial or professional affiliations that may be perceived as a conflict of interest in reviewing the manuscript, please describe those as indicated on our online review form.

**Confidentiality:** We expect reviewers to protect the confidentiality of the manuscript and ensure that it is not disseminated or exploited. Please destroy your copy of the manuscript when you are done. Only discuss the paper with a colleague with permission from the editor. We do not disclose the identity of our reviewers.

**Returning your review:** Please return your review using our form at <http://mcc.submit2science.org>. To login, use your user ID (it is included on the email notifying you of the review) and the password you have set. We can also receive reviews by email to [science\\_reviews@aaas.org](mailto:science_reviews@aaas.org) or by FAX to 202-408-1256.

#### Headquarters

1200 New York Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20005 USA • Telephone: (+1) 202-326-6550 • Fax (+1) 202-408-1256

#### Europe Office

Bateman House, 82-88 Hills road, Cambridge CB2 1LQ, UK • Telephone: (+44) 1223-326500 • Fax: (+44) 1223 326501

*Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Science*